DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 203 416 CS 503 521

TITLE Applied Communication, Argumentation, and Debate: Abstracts of Doctoral Dissertations Published in "Dissertation Abstracts International," January through June 1981 (Vol. 41 Nos. 7 through 12).

INSTITUTION ERIC Clearinghouse on Reading and Communication Skills, Urbana, Ill.

PUB DATE 81

NOTE 11p.: Pages may be marginally legible.

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.

DESCRIPTORS Annotated Bibliographies; Assertiveness; Cartoons; *Communication Research; Debate; *Discourse Analysis; *Doctoral Dissertations; *Interaction; Interpersonal Relationship; Medical Assistants; *Persuasive Discourse; Physician Patient Relationship; Physicians; Public Speaking; *Speech Communication

ABSTRACT

This collection of abstracts is part of a continuing series providing information on recent doctoral dissertations. The 14 titles deal with a variety of topics, including the following: (1) metaphor as argument in editorial cartoons, (2) conversational arguments, (3) message retention under threat of speech performance, (4) dominance and hostility in physician patient communication, (5) communication satisfaction in an urban school system, (6) the impact of shyness on the diagnostic medical interview, (7) implications of legal reasoning for a system of argumentation, and (8) the function of elaborate responses in the processing of a persuasive communication. (HTH)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED203416

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

Applied Communication, Argumentation, and Debate:

Abstracts of Doctoral Dissertations Published in Dissertation Abstracts International, January through June 1981 (Vol. 41 Nos. 7 through 12)

Compiled by the staff of the
ERIC Clearinghouse on Reading and Communication Skills

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

~~University Microfilms~~
International

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

CS503524

The dissertation titles contained here are published with permission of the University Microfilms International, publishers of Dissertation Abstracts International (copyright © 1981 by University Microfilms International), and may not be reproduced without their prior permission.

This bibliography has been compiled as part of a continuing series designed to make information on relevant dissertations available to users of the ERIC system. Monthly issues of Dissertation Abstracts International are reviewed in order to compile abstracts of dissertations on related topics, which thus become accessible in searches of the ERIC data base. Ordering information for the dissertations themselves is included at the end of the bibliography.

Abstracts of the following dissertations are included in this collection:

Banks, Barbara Jane
METAPHOR AS ARGUMENT IN EDITORIAL CARTOONS

Bednar, David Allan
RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN COMMUNICATOR STYLE AND SUPERVISORY PERFORMANCE IN COMPLEX ORGANIZATIONS: A FIELD STUDY

Carter, Brenda L.
MACHIAVELLIANISM AND VERBAL BEHAVIOR: A DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF CONVERSATIONAL ARGUMENTS

Colbert, John Addison
THE EFFECT OF EVALUATION APPREHENSION ON ATTITUDE CHANGE "IN THE PRESENCE OF A POLICE UNIFORM"

Cook, Margie Nell Ball
COMMUNICATIVE CONFIRMATION AND INTERPERSONAL SATISFACTION OF MOTHERS AND THEIR ADOLESCENT SONS

Cox, Philip Gardiner
MESSAGE RETENTION UNDER THREAT OF SPEECH PERFORMANCE

Frelinger, Acey Joy
DOMINANCE AND HOSTILITY IN PHYSICIAN-PATIENT COMMUNICATION

Fry, Deborah Sue
SHYNESS: ITS IMPACT ON THE COMMUNICATION STYLE IN THE DIAGNOSTIC MEDICAL INTERVIEW

Isenberg, Herbert Martin
A STUDY OF COMMUNICATION STRATEGIES IN TWO MEDICAL SETTINGS

Kaye, Rachelle
FEEDBACK AND PHYSICIAN COMPLIANCE WITH MEDICAL CARE CRITERIA

Nicholson, Jean Hagewood
ANALYSIS OF COMMUNICATION SATISFACTION IN AN URBAN SCHOOL SYSTEM

Nolan, Mark Jerome
ASSERTIVENESS, CALL RECEIVING BEHAVIORS, AND COMMUNICATION PERFORMANCE OF EMERGENCY CALL RECEIVERS: AN EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATION

Ulrich, Walter Alan
THE IMPLICATIONS OF LEGAL REASONING FOR A SYSTEM OF ARGUMENTATION

Vann, John William

THE FUNCTION OF ELABORATE RESPONSES IN THE PROCESSING OF A PERSUASIVE COMMUNICATION

METAPHOR AS ARGUMENT IN EDITORIAL CARTOONS

Order No. 8107300

BANKS, BARBARA JANE, PH.D. *The Ohio State University*, 1980. 233pp. Adviser: Professor William R. Brown

The scope of what rhetoricians are pleased to consider public address has broadened considerably in recent years incorporating many new forms into the province of rhetoric, but few systematic analyses of iconic rhetoric have emerged. One problem may be that existing rhetorical paradigms were designed for application to written or spoken discourse, and rhetoricians may have been reluctant to test the limits of their theories by applying them to visual rhetoric. The editorial cartoon is a good starting place for such a venture since it combines iconic and verbal forms, is clearly argumentative in nature, and has politics as its subject matter, a familiar object of study for rhetoricians.

Two concepts from rhetorical theory, the enthymeme and the metaphor, were selected as a basis for the rhetorical criticism of editorial cartoons as a reasonable solution to inherent limitations of the medium in its function as argument. The application of metaphor to this phenomenon answers the question of how representational drawings are able to constitute arguments about abstract political notions. Three views of metaphor grew out of this investigation: fusion$_1$, fusion$_2$, and fusion$_3$. Fusion$_1$ is metaphor as a condensed four-term analogy. Fusion$_2$ incorporates tension as well as fusion into metaphor by a unification of paradoxical similarities. In fusion$_3$, the differences between the referents are not important, and tension is not present, but the visual unification brings a freshness to the expression that may not exist in verbal versions of fusion$_3$. The application of the enthymemes lies in connections that arguers make between premises and their claims. In cartoons, this connection is the visual unification of premises, or metaphor.

The methodology for this study involved two parts. Part 1 consisted of a category sort by the author and rhetorical criticism of a random sample of thirty cartoons by three Pulitzer-Prize winning artists. Part 2 consisted of interviews with the same cartoonists to seek consensual validation of the findings of Part 1 and the general inferences of this study. In Part 1 of the study, the findings of the category sort were that of the thirty cartoons in the sample, twenty-three use some kind of metaphor, supporting an inference of the study that metaphor is an important way in which good cartoonists make arguments.

I inferred at the beginning of this study that existing rhetorical paradigms would prove to be workable in the criticism of editorial cartoons, and that such an application would produce some insights into the nature of the paradigms themselves. The enthymeme and the metaphor provided explanations of cartoons that made sense to both the critic and the artists that were interviewed for this study. Moreover, their use in this study resulted in two major findings. First, that metaphor can act as argument rather than merely an embellishment to it, that tension and fusion can be present in the same metaphor, and that its visual translation can redeem a faded metaphor. Second, that crucial to the success of an enthymeme is the connection that the speaker establishes between premise and claim, and that this connection may take the form of metaphor.

RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN COMMUNICATOR STYLE AND SUPERVISORY PERFORMANCE IN COMPLEX ORGANIZATIONS: A FIELD STUDY

Order No. 8102627

BEDNAR, DAVID ALLAN, PH.D. *Purdue University*, 1980. 137pp. Major Professor: W. Charles Redding

This investigation was an exploratory field study, designed to identify and describe perceived communicator style characteristics which may be associated with supervisory performance. Data were collected on managerial and supervisory employees from two business organizations located in the midwestern United States, in an attempt to answer the following research questions: (1) Are communicator style variables systematically associated with supervisory performance? More specifically, are certain style variables similarly related to performance in different organizations? (2) Do communicator style variables, associated with supervisory performance, change across different levels of perception? Specifically, are the same style variables related to performance across self, superior, subordinate, and peer perceptions?

Norton's (1978) communicator style construct, and operational measures, were employed in this research. Each manager or supervisor (target subject) was rated on the following eleven components, which constitute the domain of the communicator style construct: dominant, dramatic, contentious, animated, impression leaving, relaxed, attentive, open, friendly, precise, and communicator image. Each style variable was operationally defined as a rating on a six-point, Likert-type scale indicating the degree to which a respondent perceived a written description of that variable as accurately characterizing a designated manager or supervisor.

Perceptions of target subjects' communicator style were obtained from four sources: their superiors, their subordinates, their peers, and themselves. Since the individual target subject was the unit of analysis, these data was used to construct a series of four summary profiles on each target subject, used for purposes of analysis: (1) the subject's self-perception of his or her communicator style, (2) the subject's style of communication as perceived by subordinates, (3) the subject's style of communication as perceived by superiors, and (4) the subject's style of communication as perceived by peers.

Supervisory performance was measured by performance appraisal data on each manager and supervisor, obtained from organizational records. These data were used to classify each target subject into one of three performance categories: (1) outstanding, (2) definitely above average, and (3) fully acceptable.

For each level of perception in each organization, the communicator style variables were analyzed across the three performance categories, in order to identify significant stylistic differences among these three groups of target subjects.

The results of this investigation indicated that communicator style was significantly associated with different levels of supervisory performance in both organizations.

In the first organization, an insurance company, both *self* and *superior* Gestalt perceptions of communicator style were related, in a positive, linear fashion, to supervisory performance. In addition, the "outstanding" and "definitely above average" target subjects were described by their *superiors* as more "open," and as having a better over-all "communicator style." These same target subjects were rated by their *subordinates* as more "precise."

In the second organization, a hospital, *superior* Gestalt perceptions of communicator style were related, in a positive, linear fashion, to supervisory performance. In addition, the "outstanding" and "definitely above average" target subjects were described by their *superiors* as less "contentious," more "animated," and as having a better over-all "communicator style." These same target subjects were also rated by their *peers* as more "attentive."

None of the communicator style variables, when analyzed separately, were significantly different among the three performance categories for the *subordinate* level of perception in the hospital. Also, when analyzed separately, no significant differences were found for any of the eleven communicator style variables, in either organization, for *self*-perceptions.

MACHIAVELLIANISM AND VERBAL BEHAVIOR: A DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF CONVERSATIONAL ARGUMENTS

Order No. 8112584

CARTER, BRENDA L., PH.D. *University of Pittsburgh*, 1980. 110pp.

This study explored the relationships between Mach Score, as measured by Christie and Geis' (1970) Machiavellian Scale, sex of speaker, duration of speech, and type of discourse for 38 Ss interviewed by the Experimenter. Ss were administered a pre-test Likert-type measure of their attitudes on eight social issues and a Mach V Scale which was modified to remove masculine nouns and pronouns. Ss were asked to try to convince the Experimenter of their position on all items on which they indicated strong opinions. Ss were classified as High or Low Machs using a relative scale which was defined by counting down from the highest obtained score (126) and up from the lowest obtained score (84) while preserving the maximum distance between (13 points). This resulted in the following definitions: High Machs: 112-126 and Low Machs: 84-99.

These interviews were tape recorded, transcribed and analyzed for talk time, objective claims, self-justifying claims and disclaimers. Talk time was the mean in seconds for each S's discourse. Self-justifying claims were those declarative utterances which are stated in such a way that they seem to preclude further evidence. Objective claims are those declarative utterances which are open to further evidence and do not contain any self-justifying claims. Disclaimers are expressions that qualify objective claims.

The following hypotheses were tested: (1) High Mach males (HMM) and High Mach females (HMF) will talk significantly longer than Low Mach males (LMM) and Low Mach females (LMF). (2) High Mach males (HMM) and High Mach females (HMF) and Low Mach males (LMM) will use significantly more objective claims than Low Mach females (LMF). (3) Low Mach females (LMF) will use significantly more self-justifying claims than High Mach males (HMM), High Mach females (HMF), and Low Mach males (LMM). (4) Low Mach females (LMF) will use significantly more disclaimers than High Mach males (HMM), High Mach females (HMF), and Low Mach males (LMM).

The results of a two-way ANOVA on talk times did not significantly support Hypothesis 1. However, HMF did talk significantly ($p < .02$) longer than LMF. To test Hypothesis 2, a t test was performed on the mean number of objective claims comparing Group 1, which consisted of all HMM, HMF, and LMM, with Group 2, which consisted of all LMF. The result was not significant ($t = .29$; d.f. = 23).

To test Hypothesis 3, a $2 \times 2 \times X^2$ was performed comparing the total number of Ss who used self-justifying claims (vs Ss who did not use them) in Group 1, consisting of all HMM, HMF, and LMM, with the total number of Ss using self-justifying claims (vs Ss who did not use them) in Group 2, consisting of all LMF. The result was not significant ($X^2 = .14$; d.f. = 1).

To test Hypothesis 4, a t test was performed on the total number of disclaimers comparing Group 1, consisting of all HMM, HMF, and LMM, with Group 2, consisting of all LMF. The results were in the predicted direction and approached significance ($t = 1.33$; d.f. = 36; $p < .1$) but fell below the chosen level of rejecton ($p < .05$). These results are discussed and implications for future research suggested.

THE EFFECT OF EVALUATION APPREHENSION ON ATTITUDE CHANGE "IN THE PRESENCE OF A POLICE UNIFORM"

Order No. 8101710

COLBERT, JOHN ADDISON, PH.D. *University of Denver*, 1980. 127pp.

The wearing of a uniform by certain individuals in a society is done to create emotional reaction in other members of the group. The purpose of this study was to investigate the extent to which a military-type, standard, police uniform creates evaluation apprehension among people in the presence of the uniform. The evaluation apprehension is an anxiety-toned concern to avoid a negative evaluation by another person. In this study, it was hypothesized that college-age subjects would experience more evaluation apprehension in the presence of a uniformed policeperson than a nonuniformed policeperson. Specifically, subjects in the uniform conditions (i.e., a black and a white uniformed policeperson) would show less attitude change than subjects in the nonuniformed conditions, even though all the subjects were exposed to the powerful attitude change technique of counterattitudinal argument writing. All subjects wrote an essay that was critical of the police and then were given a scale measuring attitudes toward the police.

The subjects were 64 college students from the University of Denver. They were part of a larger group who had been given a general scale measuring student attitudes toward various local government agencies. Through this technique, it was possible to obtain a pre-attitude index of attitudes toward the police.

The actual conduct of the experiment involved picking 64 students from this general pool to come to an appointment with a black or a white police officer, either uniformed or nonuniformed, to provide some information on police/community relations. While in the experimental situation, each subject was asked to write a counterattitudinal argument on the topic. "Why the policeperson is a negative influence in American society". After writing the essay, each subject was instructed to complete an attitude questionnaire on attitudes toward the police. The questionnaire included ten attitude items which were on the original scale given the larger subject group. The subjects were also given the Marlowe-Crowne Social Desirability Scale, a measure of need to present one's self in a favorable manner. Since the pre-attitude scale ratings had been retained, it was possible to use an analysis of covariance technique in analyzing the final dependent variable information. In this way, it was possible to control for differences in pre-existing attitudes toward policepersons among the experimental subjects.

The results of the experiment indicated that subjects in the uniformed conditions (with both a black and a white officer) showed more evaluation apprehension than subjects in the nonuniformed policeperson conditions. This finding was reflected in less change in attitude (even after writing counterattitudinal arguments) or, stated, differently, more favorable attitudes toward policepersons. Therefore, the major hypothesis of the experiment was supported. Furthermore, a statistical tendency was found that subjects in the white uniformed policeperson conditions showed more evaluation apprehension than subjects in the black uniformed policeperson conditions. Also, no statistically significant difference was found among the conditions on the Marlowe-Crowne variable of self-presentation.

The significance of this experiment was that it operationalized the concept of evaluation apprehension by showing that it was reflected in resistance to attitude change. Also, the results were interpreted in terms of role theory in that the role of the policeperson (as reflected in the military-type uniform) was of more experimental significance than the personality of the individual. It was concluded that further experiments could be conducted to further describe what kinds of persons show the greatest degree of evaluation apprehension.

COMMUNICATIVE CONFIRMATION AND INTERPERSONAL SATISFACTION OF MOTHERS AND THEIR ADOLESCENT SONS

Order No. 8101712

COOK, MARGIE NELL BALL, PH.D. *University of Denver*, 1980. 129pp.

The purpose of this descriptive study was to examine some of the correlates of confirming behavior shown by mothers in interactions with their sons.

The following research hypotheses were tested: (1) The level of confirming behavior shown by the mother in her dyadic interaction with her son is positively correlated with her son's perception of her level of confirmation. (2) A relationship exists between the ethnicity of the mother-son dyads and the level of confirming behavior displayed by the mother in the dyad. (3) A positive relationship exists between the level of confirmation exhibited by mothers in the interaction and the degree of satisfaction experienced by their adolescent sons.

Sixty-three mother-son dyads discussed questions relating to parent-child relationships for 30 minute periods. The discussions were recorded on audio tape and subsequently categorized using Sieburg's Descriptive Paradigm of Interpersonal Communication. Following the discussion the sons completed the Perceived Confirmation Inventory and the Liebig Satisfaction-Attraction Scale.

No significant correlation was found between the confirming behavior of the mothers as revealed by Sieburg's descriptive paradigm and the level of confirmation perceived by their sons. Therefore the first hypothesis was not supported. The disconfirmation frequencies and ratios of Caucasian mothers were found to be significantly greater than the disconfirmation frequencies and ratios of Black mothers. This result supported the second hypothesis. The limited nature of this study does not make it possible to determine whether this outcome is specific to mother-son dyads or a more general difference related to ethnicity. The third hypothesis, that satisfaction is related to confirmation level, was not supported. Perceived confirmation and the age of the son were found to predict the son's satisfaction with his performance in the mother-son dyad. The difference in age between the mother and son was positively related to the satisfaction of the son with the interaction.

MESSAGE RETENTION UNDER THREAT OF SPEECH PERFORMANCE

Order No. 8101713

COX, PHILIP GARDINER, PH.D. *University of Denver*, 1980. 213pp.

The purpose of this study was to test a proposition presented in a new general theory of the consequences of human communication. The proposition occurs under an explanation of the role of speech in defense of self under threat. The proposition predicts that threat to self will be accompanied by a focus of greater attention by the threatened individual on the communicative output of another.

The problem area with which the present study was concerned has been represented by discrepant, apparently paradoxical, research findings. These findings indicate that the presence of threat to self-acceptance enhances scores on measures of accuracy in communication. The presence of interpersonal trust had been uniquely predicted to have such effect.

The new general theory offers an explanation of the apparent paradox. It is postulated that threat to self potentiates the reception of communication through a reorientation of self-concern.

For the purpose of this study, an experimental test of the proposition, a novel condition of threat was created. Specifically addressed to speech communication, this variable took the form of the induction of a requirement to speak in front of a group. Under the terms of the proposition, it was hypothesized that such threat would increase the subsequent retention of a message spoken by another. Threat associated with speech performance was shown to be supported in literature related to communication research. Relationship of the new general theory to prior theory was reviewed in terms of the proposition selected for study.

An experiment was conducted employing 124 University speech communication students as participants. Threat was applied to one of three groups randomly assigned from the sample. The desired sample size was retained throughout the study. Data were acquired through administration of a message retention measure subsequent to the presentation of a standardized (video taped) informational message. The design and conduct of this study emphasized the avoidance of the demand characteristic set within the laboratory.

The data were subjected to statistical observation through the analysis of variance. The analysis did not indicate significance in support of the research hypothesis. A corollary control hypothesis was accepted.

Findings included the observation of characteristically agitated behaviors among participants in the experimentally threatened group. This behavioral result was not reflected in the message retention data. It was suggested that the novel variable of threat of speech performance may offer utility in future research.

DOMINANCE AND HOSTILITY IN PHYSICIAN-PATIENT COMMUNICATION

FRELINGER, ACEY JOY, PH.D. *University of Southern California*, 1981. Chairman: Professor James H. McBath

Communication between physicians and patients is examined for dominance and hostility exhibited in the question form. Specifically, the study examines physician and patient questions to identify if both parties are asking the majority of their questions in a dominant form. When both parties use the dominant question form they vie for control of the relationship and hostility is exhibited in the messages. Thirty-one communication interactions between physicians on morning rounds and hospitalized oncology patients at the University of Southern California/Los Angeles County General Hospital were recorded to identify the questions and requests posed between physicians and patients. Using an algorithm questions and requests were coded for dominance-submission and affiliation-hostility. Interrater reliability was at the .98 level. The data support the conclusion that both physician and patient use the dominant form for asking the majority of their questions and that hostility develops in the questions when this occurs. This finding suggests that patients may be inhibited from asking questions when physicians use the dominant hostile form.

SHYNESS: ITS IMPACT ON THE COMMUNICATION STYLE IN THE DIAGNOSTIC MEDICAL INTERVIEW

Order No. 8102372

FRY, DEBORAH SUE, PH.D. *Southern Illinois University at Carbondale*, 1980. 141pp. Major Professor: Dr. Edward L. McGlone

Shyness in student physicians was examined for its impact on their communication style during simulated diagnostic medical interviews. Theoretical and philosophical issues concerning the differentiation between shyness as a condition and the related experiences (i.e., communication anxiety and/or communication apprehension) and behaviors (i.e., stagefright and/or reticence) were discussed. An explanation of shyness as a tripartite meaning interaction was developed. Models illustrating this tripartite relationship were created.

Shyness was examined in light of available representative research. A social psychological explanation was justified as the perspective of the present text. Shyness as a social psychological variable was viewed in the context of the "communication style" construct and the diagnostic medical interview.

An analysis of shyness in first year student physicians at Southern Illinois University School of Medicine was conducted. Three self-report measures of the condition, behavior, and experience of social anxiety were administered. These included the Stanford Shyness Survey, (Zimbardo, 1978), the Social Avoidance and Distress Scale (Watson & Friend, 1969), and the Personal Report of Communication Apprehension (McCroskey, 1970).

Descriptive results of the SSS indicated that shyness among student physicians was consistently representative of shyness as it has been reported by other shy populations. Approximately 40-45% of the total population reported being presently shy.

Situations, activities, and types of people reported as creating shyness were strongly correlated with the size of the group and/or the role relationship the subjects perceived as being defined by the situation or interaction. One-to-one interactions with persons of the opposite sex, large groups, and situations where subjects were of lower status, being evaluated, and/or felt vulnerable were the most frequently reported environmental instigators of shyness.

Psychological reactions, specific thoughts, feelings, or sensations, and overt behaviors associated most frequently with the experience of shyness were reported. These generally included blushing, perspiration, and increased pulse; self consciousness; silence or avoidance of others, inability to make eye contact and low speaking voice.

A comparative analysis of self-reported shy and nonshy student physicians communication style during diagnostic medical interviewing was administered. Multiple regression analyses (stepwise and standard) using the combined score of the student physicians' two self-report measures (SAD; PRCA) as a dependent variable, and the content and process scores of the perceptual responses from the student physicians, programmed patients, and the expert reviewers, involved in the ICM interviewing program at Southern Illinois School of Medicine, along with the sex composition of the interview dyad as independent variables were conducted.

Results indicated a significant difference between shy and nonshy student physicians communication style during the diagnostic medical interview. The weighted sum of the content and process score variables and the sex composition variable was found to be a significant predictor of shyness among student physicians. Expert reviewers' process feedback assessing the student physicians' ability to direct and control patient talk was a statistically significant predictor of shyness. Student physicians' perceptions of their process behaviors was also found to be a statistically significant predictor of shyness. Student physicians' content scores, programmed patients' content and process scores and expert reviewers content scores, while indicating a tendency toward shyness in student physicians, were not statistically significant predictors of shyness. The sex composition of the interview dyad was the weakest predictor of shyness in student physicians.

A STUDY OF COMMUNICATION STRATEGIES IN TWO MEDICAL SETTINGS

Order No. 8100027

ISENBERG, HERBERT MARTIN, PH.D. *University of California, San Diego*, 1980. 299pp. Chairman: Professor Aaron Cicourel

This study is an investigation into the possibility of empirically "bridging the gap" between micro and macro levels of analysis through the detailed examination of discourse materials that are reflexively tied to their social or organizational contexts. The two social/organizational contexts, or field research settings, from which materials were collected for this study were (1) a health care clinic, and (2) a high-ranking medical advisory board.

The collection of data from these two medical settings consisted primarily of tape recordings of discourse activity that were transcribed for purposes of analysis. The data base from the medical advisory board included the official minutes of its meetings. This addition of textual materials resulted in the development of (1) summarization principles, and (2) a substantive form of analysis, as a means of exploring the relationship between micro-interactional activities and the production of macro-social structures and information.

The research that comprises this study attempted to deal with the following sociological issues of (1) How does a social setting become available for investigation?, (2) the development of an analytical technique that may be systematically applied across settings, and (3) discourse analysis and its application.

Initially, I experimented with a variety of research methodologies to determine what they would yield when applied to the data bases from both settings. As this style of research progressed, it became increasingly clear that traditional sociological methods and theories were not capable of successfully integrating data at both micro and macro levels of explanation. Consequently, it became necessary to initiate the design of a methodology that could analyze, simultaneously, micro and macro materials in relation to an ethnography of the context in which they were produced. The term used to describe this style of analysis is substantive sociology.

The development of a substantive methodology or analysis draws from work in cognitive sociology, conflict theory, and conversational analysis. The idea here was that a substantive sociology would be capable of locating macro-interactional processes. These are processes or interactional techniques that members employ to produce social structures that can be analyzed at either a micro or macro level. One outcome of the use of substantive methodologies was the location of a macro-interactional technique called the titling process. Macro-interactional processes are seen as one way to begin to "fill the gap" or create a balance between micro and macro forms of analysis.

FEEDBACK AND PHYSICIAN COMPLIANCE WITH MEDICAL CARE CRITERIA

Order No. 8101700

KAYE, RACHELLE, PH.D. *University of Denver*, 1980. 127pp.

The purpose of this study was to examine the effect of feedback on physician compliance with medical care criteria. Six different modes of communication used to feed back a discrepancy between behavior and medical care criteria to the involved individuals have been investigated to determine whether any of them are associated with greater change in the direction of compliance with the criteria than any other.

The study is a descriptive field study using data derived from medical care evaluation studies conducted by hospital medical staffs. The study utilized a stratified random blocked sample of 144 cases derived from 517 medical care evaluation study criteria with pre and post feedback scores. The dependent measure was change, which is the difference between pre and post feedback scores. The independent variables were: (1) Feedback. (a) oral group feedback. (b) oral individual feedback. (c) written group feedback. (d) written feedback to individuals. (e) oral group feedback with written communication. (f) oral group feedback with a policy or procedure decision. (2) Topic type, defined as medical or surgical topic. (3) Deficiency type, defined as a performance or documentation deficiency. (4) Hospital size.

The hypotheses for change as a result of feedback are tested throught a t-test for pre and post feedback behavior, a oneway analysis of variance for the feedback conditions to determine the relative effect of six feedback modes, and a multiple step-wise regression to determine the correlation of the remaining independent variables with change.

The major analysis yielded the following results: (1) The t-test to determine the association between feedback and change showed a highly significant difference between pre and post feedback scores. (2) The oneway analysis of variance yielded no statistically significant differences among feedback conditions. (3) The regression analysis yielded a high correlation between the size of the pre feedback score and change, but no significant correlations between topic type, deficiency type, hospital size, and change.

A supplementary analysis was performed using percent of goal achieved as the dependent measure in place of simple change. The one-way analysis of variance yielded an F which was statistically significant at .20. A multiple range test using the LSD procedure showed a difference between written group feedback and the means for the remaining five feedback conditions at a .25 confidence level. The regression analysis showed no significant correlation between the pre feedback score and the dependent measure. There was no significant correlation between the dependent measure and the remaining independent variables.

The conclusions based on these findings are: (1) that feedback of a discrepancy between values and behavior does elicit significant change in behavior, (2) that the type of feedback used does not significantly influence the amount of change achieved, with the exception of written group communication, which would appear to have less influence on change than the other five feedback modes, (3) that the topic under study, the type of deficiency and the size of the hospital do not influence the amount of change achieved.

ANALYSIS OF COMMUNICATION SATISFACTION IN AN URBAN SCHOOL SYSTEM

Order No. 8105522

NICHOLSON, JEAN HAGEWOOD, PH.D. *George Peabody College for Teachers of Vanderbilt University*, 1980. 143pp. Major Professor: William O. Huckaby, III

Communication satisfaction of secondary educators in the Metropolitan Nashville Public School System was studied in this research project. The level of communication satisfaction, the relationship between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction, and the relationship between communication satisfaction and certain demographic characteristics of the subjects was examined. The 290 subjects, representing 16 percent of the population, consisted of a randomly selected group of public school educators who work with students of grades seven to twelve. Both administrators and teachers were included in the sample.

Subjects were asked to respond to the Communication Satisfaction Questionnaire (CSQ) and to the Personal and School Information Questionnaire. The CSQ, which was developed by Cal W. Downs and Michael Hazen, had previously been administered to individuals employed by private organizations. This research study was the first to use the CSQ in a public school system. The CSQ consists of forty organizational communication items which encompass eight components: general organizational perspective, personal feedback, organizational integration, communication with superiors, communication climate, horizontal communication, media quality, and communication with subordinates. Additionally, there is a global measure of job satisfaction with the CSQ. The reliability of the questionnaire is reported by the authors to be .94. The Personal and School Information Sheet was formulated by the researcher, and sought information concerning the respondents' age, sex, level of training, job role, tenure status, school population, and education work experience. Data were subjected to descriptive and correlative statistics. Comparison was made of the results of the present study and of previous studies in which the CSQ was used.

The findings indicated that the majority of secondary educators were satisfied with the school system's communications. In every communication component percentage responses of the subjects were higher in the satisfaction category than the responses in the dissatisfaction category. Not only were most of the subjects satisfied with the school system's communications, a significant relationship between the level of job satisfaction and the level of satisfaction of each of the eight communication components was found. Also, there were significant correlation scores between job role, training level, education work experience, and certain communication components; in the multiple linear-regression analysis, age of the subjects strengthened the level of communication satisfaction in the communication with subordinates component. Since there is a paucity of research regarding communication in educational organizations and since communication is such a pervasive feature of the total organization, recommendation is made to continue the study of communication in public school systems.

ASSERTIVENESS, CALL RECEIVING BEHAVIORS, AND COMMUNICATION PERFORMANCE OF EMERGENCY CALL RECEIVERS: AN EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATION

Order No. 8100320

NOLAN, MARK JEROME, PH.D. *Bowling Green State University*, 1980. 110pp.

The purpose of this exploratory study was to examine the perceptions of subjects regarding the communication performance of emergency call receivers (ECRs) handling actual police emergency telephone calls.

In order to examine the perceptions of Ss regarding the performance of ECRs, an empirical study was designed and executed. Samples of actual ECR citizen caller interactions were obtained and three sets of dependent variables were used to measure Ss' perceptions of the ECR's assertiveness, call receiving behaviors, and overall performance. These ratings were subjected to discriminant analysis and to canonical correlation analysis.

Results of the discriminant analysis revealed that the ECRs were maximally differentiated on four statistically significant ($p < .0001$) dimensions (roots) of assertiveness and four statistically significant ($p < .0001$) dimensions (roots) of call receiving behaviors. Results of the canonical correlation analysis revealed that Ss' ratings of the ECRs on the Call Receiving Behavior Scales and on the Assertiveness Scales were highly interrelated ($p < .0001$) on seventeen statistically significant dimensions (roots), that Ss' ratings of the ECRs on the Assertiveness Scales and on the Performance Scales were highly interrelated ($p < .0001$) on two statistically significant dimensions (roots), and that Ss' ratings of the ECRs on the Call Receiving Behaviors Scales and on the Performance Scales were highly interrelated ($p < .0001$) on two statistically significant dimensions (roots).

The results of this study were seen as indicating that assertiveness is a relevant construct in assessing the performance of ECRs, and that a variety of communication attributes and behaviors are related to the overall performance of ECRs.

THE IMPLICATIONS OF LEGAL REASONING FOR A SYSTEM OF ARGUMENTATION

Order No. 8111758

ULRICH, WALTER ALAN, PH.D. *University of Kansas*, 1980. 182pp.

Stephen Toulmin has suggested that argument takes place in various fields, with both field-invariant and field-variant rules. Since Toulmin's theory of argument is based largely upon his work in the hard sciences, an examination of argument in other fields was warranted. The field of law is an appropriate field to investigate, since early rhetorical theory was drawn from law; contemporary rhetoricians such as Perelman and Toulmin base some of their theories of argument on legal concepts, and legal argument is considered by many to be one of the highest forms of argument. This study investigates the theories of legal argument developed by three leading legal scholars--Edward Levi, Lon Fuller, and Herbert Wechsler--and suggests some implications of these theories for a broader view of argument in other fields. The primary material used in this study is the body of material written by these three authors, as well as the critical responses to these three theorists published in law reviews and books on jurisprudence.

Chapter II discusses Edward Levi, who represents one view of legal argument based upon a reliance on precedents. Reasoning by precedent is often justified because it promotes stability, allows individuals to rely on the courts, provides equality, restrains the judges, terminates litigation, and enables the courts to operate efficiently. At the same time, the use of precedents reduces the flexibility of law. Levi attempts to resolve the conflict between stability and change by proposing a moving classification system that uses the ambiguity in language to develop evolving systems to compare like and unlike cases.

Chapter III examines the legal theory of Lon Fuller. Lon Fuller contrasts the morality of duty with the morality of aspiration, and suggests that the legal systems have both minimal standards (the morality of duty) that they must meet, as well as other unobtainable goals (the morality of aspiration) that they should strive to meet. In addition, there is an inner morality of law that consists of certain standards that lawmakers should attempt to meet.

Chapter IV discusses Herbert Wechsler's theory of neutral principles. Herbert Wechsler argues that judges should decide cases using neutral principles. The nature of these principles has been debated by many scholars. Wechsler could mean one of six things when he calls for neutral principles; the certiorari policy should be made clearer; reasons should be given for decisions; judges should ignore the results of decisions; judges should ignore values; judges should provide acceptable reasons for their decisions; or judges should look beyond the immediate case in deciding cases. Each of these views of neutral principles pose problems for the judge attempting to utilize neutral principles.

While the concepts discussed by each of these three theorists have value for students of argumentation, they also aid in discovering the characteristics that distinguish one field from another. These implications are discussed in Chapter V. Fields have four characteristics. First, each field has a specific goal. That goal helps decide the methods used in deciding disputes. Second, each field has conditions for relevance. This allows the field to decide what arguments it should address, as well as what information it should seek. Third, each field has a forum in which its arguments take place. Finally, each field has members which have characteristics and roles that promote argument in that field.

Thus, this study attempts to evaluate three views of legal reasoning and to use these views of legal reasoning to discuss the nature of fields of argument, as well as specific implications of legal reasoning for a system of argumentation.

THE FUNCTION OF ELABORATE RESPONSES IN THE PROCESSING OF A PERSUASIVE COMMUNICATION

Order No. 8105626

VANN, JOHN WILLIAM, PH.D. *The University of Florida*, 1980. 358pp. Chairman: Joel B. Cohen

The purpose of this dissertation is to further understanding of the role of elaborative responses in the processing of persuasive communications. A theoretical background of information processing is provided with special attention given to the nature and role of sub-vocal responses. A review of the persuasion literature which presumes an intervening role of elaborative responses is presented with a focus upon those studies which examined the effects of distraction on persuasion. Methodological guidance is provided for doing experimentation in the realm of elaborative responses.

The experimental approach consisted of experimentally manipulating the assailability of the pre-message information (high and low), the credibility of the message source (high and low) and the discrepancy between the pre-message position and the position expressed in the message (low, moderate and high). Verbal protocols of reported elaboration were elicited along with measures of message acceptance. A manipulation check revealed that the manipulations of assailability and source credibility were deficient. Consequently, causal conclusions regarding the effects of these variables may not be made. Increasing discrepancy from low to moderate increased those negative protocol statements as a proportion of all protocol statements. High discrepancy resulted in a significant shift in pre-message position when compared with a no-message control. Correlational analysis indicated that coded protocols were significantly related to other criterion measures, with the proportion of negative statements being the best predictor.

An internal analysis examined the relationship between manipulation measures and criterion measures. This correlational analysis indicated that the criterion measures which were relevant to the message were related to source credibility, while those relevant to the background information were related to assailability. However, the expected cross-relationships were not observed. Suggestions for further research in the area are presented.

Copies of the dissertations may be obtained by addressing your request to:

University Microfilms International
300 North Zeeb Road
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106

or by telephoning (toll-free) 1-800-521-3042